



MEETING MINUTES

Restoration Advisory Board (RAB)

For the Former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads

Centro Cívico la Seyba, Ceiba, Puerto Rico

Meeting No. 5 - August 7, 2007

Note: These minutes are a summary based on informal notes taken at the meeting. They are not intended as a verbatim transcript and may not have captured everything that was discussed. If comments or additional notes are provided by others who were present at the meeting, within 30 days of distribution of these minutes, those will be added as an attachment to these minutes.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOMING REMARKS

The meeting began at 6:15 pm. There were 14 community members in attendance, in addition to the RAB members. (See Attachment 1 for attendance list.)

Susana Struve (CH2M HILL) asked if everyone has received information. Ismael Velazquez (RAB member) responded yes, 2 days ago. We are still trying to resolve the mailing delay issues.

Ismael Velazquez said there is a flood warning today until midnight, and many people that he had asked will not come, because of the weather conditions. He asked that we postpone this meeting until a later date. Lilyana Betancourt (community member) added that visitors are important and needed for decision-making.

Mark Davidson (Navy RAB Co-Chair) replied that it would be at least another month if we were to postpone the meeting. He proposed to hold the meeting as planned tonight, and then we will recap at the next meeting for those who missed it because of the weather.

Timothy Gordon (EPA) added that (1) EPA may not be able to attend the next meeting due to budget concerns, and (2) there are no final environmental decisions to be made at this meeting, so that is not a reason to cancel the meeting. Susana pointed out that the only decision that might be made tonight is about the charter, which is an issue for only the RAB members, not visitors.

II. ACTION ITEMS

The following action items were discussed. Two previous action items were closed, two are ongoing, and eight new action items were added. Additional discussion about selected action items follows this summary table.

Item	Description	Discussion	Status as of Aug 29, 2007
#1	Navy and RAB community members: Develop and sign the Roosevelt Roads RAB charter	RAB members submitted a draft, Navy revised. RAB members to meet internally to discuss the proposed changes, respond to the Navy, or finalize if they are in agreement. Navy and Community Co-Chairs will schedule a conference call.	Ongoing
#2	Navy: Provide more information about suspicions that a cache of ammunition had been covered over (vegetated mound observed in the magazine area, during the RAB March 2007 site tour - "the mound").	As shown in the March site tour handouts (Attachment 4), historic photography suggests that this was simply a mound of dirt placed as a barrier to protect some nearby buildings (which are gone now) in case a magazine blew up. However, the Navy is investigating further what activities may have taken place at these former buildings.	Ongoing
#3	Navy: provide a list of upcoming documents for the RAB members to identify where they would like technical assistance.	List was mailed to RAB members and available at this meeting. These documents are not destined for public comment. RAB members can go to the Navy's cleanup program and marketing websites (http://nsrr-ir.org/ and http://www.roosey-roads.com/) for more information about the sites that are on this deliverables list.	Completed
#4	Lilyana Betancourt to share with Navy her list of buildings/facilities she believes are affected by contaminants	The Navy will review the list of buildings and contamination concerns. It will take some time to go through the list.	New
#5	Navy to provide technical presentations for each of the sites under investigation (found on the deliverables list)	It will take more than one meeting to cover all the sites; will work down the list over several RAB meetings.	New
#6	Navy to provide information about Area 46C, where Ismael Velásquez believes that transformers contaminated the soil with PCBs.	Details about the investigation of this site were presented at the August RAB meeting - Pole Yard Site. The Navy will prepare a workplan to investigate the site.	Completed

Item	Description	Discussion	Status as of Aug 29, 2007
#7	Ismael Velázquez to provide information about a spill he witnessed at AOC C	Pedro Ruiz will accompany Ismael to locate this area	New
#8	Neida Pumarejo Cintrón (Fideicomiso de Conservación de Puerto Rico) to provide information about recreational activities that will be compatible with the conditions of the mangroves	The Conservation Trust will make a presentation at the October RAB meeting.	New
#9	LRA to request Department of Natural Resources (DNER) participation in RAB meetings	RAB members have many questions for DNER	New
#10	Navy (Jeff) to email the English version of Responsiveness Summary for CDR to RAB members (Lirio Márquez and Jorge Porto)	The Responsiveness Summary has been mailed.	Completed
#11	LRA to take RAB member (Rafael Montes) to the dry area across the bay, identify the place and respond to his concerns.		New

Action Item # 3 – Upcoming technical deliverables (from previous meeting) and Action Items # 4 and 5 (new – follow up)

- Lilyana Betancourt (visitor) said that for the SWMUs and AOCs she wants to know exactly what affected facilities/buildings that are contained within each. A map would be helpful. She says that she has a list of about 300 facilities that she believes are affected by contamination.
- Jorge Fernández Porto (RAB member) asked whether all of the sites listed are on lands designated for early transfer. Mark Davidson replied yes. Some may be on the sale parcels; others are on parcels to be channeled through the LRA. Except for Piñeros Island, they are all under the CDR. Jorge asked whether some of the sites will be sold before the investigations are completed. Mark D. says yes, it could happen; for example, some of the airport parcels.
- Timothy Gordon (EPA) clarified that if such a parcel is transferred, the Navy would not be relieved of responsibility for cleaning up the site [as scheduled] until a 3rd party order was negotiated between the EPA and the new owner, gone through public review, approved, and signed.
- Jorge Porto is concerned that a parcel will be put up for sale before an investigation document is finalized. Mark Davidson replied that bidders for these parcels will have to do due diligence of these sites, and they must show that they have a technical understanding of the site investigation and the capability to complete the cleanup. Since there are many unknowns in environmental investigations, the potential buyers must have the environmental insurance required to cover these unknowns.

- Ismael Velázquez (RAB member) stated that RAB members have the responsibility to tell the community what has happened at the base.
- Luis Velazquez (RAB member) said that the *El Nuevo Día* newspaper has an article (coming from an article that was published in a US paper) describing the lands that will be sold without cleanup. He demanded that this not happen, and called the government representatives present to take responsibility. He believes that the contamination is not limited to the Navy base, but it has flowed out to the lands surrounding the base and in Ceiba; if this is not true, an article should be published saying so.
- Mark Davidson reiterated that the Navy cannot get out of the 7003 Consent Order. The Navy is bound by law to ensure that the cleanup is complete. The 3rd party orders will bind new owners to the obligations under that agreement.

Action Item #6 - Area 46C (from previous meeting) and **#7-AOC C** (new):

- Ismael Velázquez believes the transformers leaked PCBs. He worked there during Hurricane Hugo (1987-89).
- Mark Davidson explained that there is a containment wall there to protect against the transformer oil leaking into the environment. The valve on the wall was to drain the rain water from the containment area. There may have been some oil in the water that was drained. You can see some stressed vegetation (dead grass). He explained the investigation process, followed by soil removal, and more sampling and analysis.
- Timothy Gordon (EPA) wants to understand that they have identified the correct site. Ismael Velázquez said that there were actually 2 sites (SWMU 46, and AOC C). He described the oil spill that he had witnessed. Mark Kimes (Baker) said that these sites have already been identified as SWMUs and AOCs. Timothy Gordon added that EPA expects that sampling and analysis will be done to determine the nature and extent of the contamination.
- Mark Kimes noted that when the Area 46C was pointed out by Ismael, immediate action was taken to investigate his claim. Tonight Ismael has brought up a new issue, and that will also be investigated expeditiously and he will be consulted for the exact information. Timothy Gordon added that there will be an investigation to determine if there is residual contamination.
- Jorge Porto identified two additional issues: (1) a language barrier that does not allow efficient communication; (2) that the Navy must move quickly to meet with the people who can identify sources of contamination and take them to the sites to get their input.
- Mark Davidson urged Ismael Velázquez to go to Pedro Ruiz's office at Roosevelt Roads and arrange a date when he can take Pedro to the additional site he brought up tonight and provide what he knows about it.

Item #2 - Vegetated mound in the magazine area (from previous meeting):

- Luis Velázquez (RAB member) asked for an answer from the Navy about the alleged ammunitions magazine that RAB members saw during the site visit in March [*a vegetated mound inside the fence line of the magazine area; see photos in Attachment 4*]. Jeff Meyers answered that they have been investigating John Henry's claim that there were nuclear weapons stored there. He is in the process of researching, but information about nuclear

weapons in general is classified, so it's not a quick answer. He hopes that he will have an answer for the next RAB meeting.

- Ismael Velázquez (RAB member) said that the weapons department was in charge of this area and highly classified activities were conducted there. He thinks there may have been parts of atomic bombs stored there.

III. RAB SUGGESTED TOPICS

Airport Fuel Spill: Pedro Ruiz (Naval Activity Puerto Rico) said that immediate action was taken at the time of the fuel spill in 1999. After the spill was cleaned up, an assessment was performed in the area to see what damage he spill had done. He explained the Compensatory Restoration Plan for the affected area (Los Machos Mangrove Forest). There was already a problem identified there, because of the exchange of waters between the bay and the mangrove area. He described the channel expansion and new bridge that will be constructed. The original water level was 5 to 10 feet, depending on the sediments. When restoration started, the water level at some of these points was only 5 inches; now water levels are back at 5-6 feet.

- Francisco Fronteras (alternate for RAB member William Lourido) pointed out that that mangrove was shredded and not offered to the fishermen. He asked if the changes will be monitored and who will be responsible for this process? Pedro Ruiz replied that there will be monitoring performed for 3 to 5 years, possibly by the new owner of the land, but the Navy will remain legally responsible.
- Jorge Porto stated that as far as he understand, the monitoring will be in the hands of the Puerto Rican Conservation Trust (PRCT)
- Francisco Fronteras asked if the PRCT has the technical capacity to accurately analyze the data and make decisions, or will they just set up a fence and say don't trespass. Neida Pumarejo Cintrón (PRCT representative to the RAB) said yes, they have the tools to make the decisions, and they will adequately monitor the area. There is a management plan that will be implemented.
- Lirio Marquez asked about the height of the bridge and the new, higher water level. Pedro Ruiz responded that a small fishing boat will be able to pass under. Carlos Brown (RAB member) said it will be 3 ft, 6 inches. The idea of the project was to restore the area and have water flowing, not to have boats in the area. It has both positive aspects (more water flow) and negative aspects (trash moving into the mangroves).
- Rafael Montes (RAB member) said that he understands that the area also will be used for recreation in the future. Why not build a bridge that will allow bigger boats to pass through? Neida Pumarejo explained that she is an attorney, not a biologist, so she can't speak to the conditions of the mangrove. The PRCT will not allow activities that are harmful to nature; they will protect the areas.
- Community member asked EPA how much it cost and if it was a fine for the spill in 1999? Timothy Gordon replied that as he understands it, an assessment study was done, and if there was harm, which in this case there was, a mitigation measure must be implemented. That is the equivalent of a fine.

- Ismael Velázquez applauded the action taken by the Navy in this case. But he does have a concern: who will keep the mouth of the channel open, free of debris and sediment? Jeff Meyers (Navy BRAC Environmental Coordinator) said the PRCT will manage the property as it sees fit.
- Lirio Marquez suggested that the PRCT begin discussion with the local fishermen in the area to work out a good management plan for the use of that area.
- Agustin Velázquez (RAB member) said if the fuel spill killed all of the fauna of the area, a resource for food was taken away from the local poor people. Pedro Ruiz clarified that the spill didn't occur in the mangrove area where the bridge is constructed, that this area had absolutely no contact with the fuel. *[See Attachment 2, Presentations, pages 5-6, for maps showing the spill area and the restoration area.]*
- Luis Velázquez (RAB member): Doesn't understand because the mangrove that was killed is closer to the mouth of the channel. Pedro replied that the intention of the mitigation project is to restore the area to its prior condition; nothing was contaminated in the mouth of the channel to the mangroves.
- Ismael Velázquez said that the Navy is compensating for the damage done to the mouth by the mitigation project that they're implementing.
- Francisco Fronteras believes that the DNER and PRCT do not have the staff or resources to make adequate management decisions in these technical areas because of lack of money and resources. He believes that these opportunities to do analysis and monitoring are very valuable.
- Neida Pumarejo asked Francisco Fronteras to visit one of the reserves (Hacienda La Esperanza) to see what they are capable of doing. They are managing 22 protected areas in Puerto Rico. They consider this mangrove protection/mitigation project extremely important. Also, the Navy will not be relieved of the responsibility for completing this project.
- Jorge Porto added that DNER will very soon be a stakeholder of this land, and they should send a representative to these meetings to answer questions from the community.
- Rafael Montes (RAB member) asked if there is another way for the DNER to persuade the government to move the small arms firing range to an area that is not a protected conservation area and is also not in a recreational use area? If it is used for that purpose, they will have to restrict that entire area from public use.

IV. WHAT'S NEW

Jeff Meyers provided an update on the Finding of Suitability for Transfer (FOSTs) for the Hospital and Conservation parcels, and the current status of the CDR. He invited RAB members to log into the new Roosevelt Roads marketing website (<http://www.roosey-roads.com/>) to see and hear a presentation of the status of sites on the parcels that will be put up for sale.

- Alfonso Martínez (LRA) stated that the LRA has urged the Governor not to sign the CDR yet. Antonio Colorado met with the Governor and wants to assure the RAB of this fact.
- Lirio Marquez has visited the website and said she was not aware that the parcels on the waterfront were marked for sale as Parcel 1. Jeff Meyers explained that the map is intended to show that whoever buys the sale parcels will be able to use the facilities on the waterfront.
- Luis Velázquez asked about Punta Puerca and the parcel close to the airport, which have been marked for sale. Alfonso Martínez responded that Antonio Colorado has already written a letter to the Forest Service and the DNR/Conservation Trust saying that Punta Puerca should be taken out of the sale area.
- Luis Velázquez said that there have been no public hearings with the community to discuss these issues. The local people know valuable information regarding these areas. Alfonso Martínez responded that the LRA will hold a meeting with the people (with Matrix and the mayor of Ceiba) to answer questions and concerns. The meeting will be on August 27, at 7:00 pm, at the Multiple Use Center in Ceiba. The Navy is also invited.
- Rafael Montes asked about the dry forest area across the bay, where the Coast Guard used to be (also known as the officers' beach, the housing beach). He said that this area was completely burned inside the mangroves. Alfonso Martínez (LRA) offered to go there with him so he can pinpoint the site. Jeff Meyers added that this will be part of the conservation parcel.
- A community member asked if these areas are open to the public? Alfonso Martínez (LRA) said that if the plans are finalized, they will make them available to the public before the next meeting.

V. RCRA PROCESS

Tim Gordon completed his presentation of the RCRA Corrective Action process. The weather conditions worsened (heavy rain), so the meeting ended at this point, with several agenda items not covered (see Attachment 2).

VI. MEETING CLOSURE

The next RAB meeting will be in October. The meeting closed at 8:45 PM.

ATTACHMENT 1 - Meeting Attendees

RAB Community Members in Attendance	RAB Community Members Absent
Carlos Brown	Noraida Vázquez Arce
Samuel Caraballo	John Henry
Jorge Fernández Porto	Jimmy Concepción Robles
Francisco Frontera (for William Lourido)	Ángel de Jesús Matta
Lirio Márquez D'Acunti	José Díaz
Rafael Montes	Rogelio Figueroa
Agustín Velázquez Santos	Daniel E. González
Ismael Velazquez	Debra McWhirter
Luís A. Velázquez Rivera	Ramón M. Ríos
	Ramón D. Figueroa, Community Co-Chair (excused)
	Myrna Maldonado
Community Members Visiting	
Manuel Martinez	Lilyana Betancourt
Danny Velázquez	Manny Flores
Maria M. Avila	Angelo Cruz
Jose R. Candelaria	Hiram Rivera
Placido Diaz	José A. Rosa
Aurelio Colon Santiago	
RAB Agency Representatives in Attendance	
Mark Davidson, Navy Co-Chair	Remedial Project Manager for the former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads
Timothy Gordon	U.S. EPA, Remedial Project Manager
Wilmarie Rivera	Junta de Calidad Ambiental de Puerto Rico
Josefina González	Junta de Calidad Ambiental de Puerto Rico
Neida Pumarejo Cintrón	Fideicomiso de Conservación
Alfonso Martínez	Portal del Futuro (LRA)
Other Agency Representatives Present	
Pedro Ruiz	Environmental Program Manager, Naval Activity Puerto Rico (NAPR)
Jeffrey Meyers	BRAC Environmental Coordinator, Navy Program Management Office Southeast
Support Staff Present	
Susana Struve	CH2M HILL, Inc. (meeting facilitator, Navy contractor)
Mark Kimes	Baker Environmental, Inc. (Navy Installation Restoration Program, Contractor)
Sara Vivas	CH2M HILL, Inc. (meeting notes, Navy contractor)

ATTACHMENT 2 - Meeting Presentations

ATTACHMENT 3 - Meeting Handouts

ATTACHMENT 4 - Magazine Area photos (March 2007 site tour)